

## Long-Term Insights Briefing: Consultation on draft briefing – summary of suggested revisions

| General feedback              |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Topic                         | Suggested revisions                                                                                                       | Specific feedback and <i>Manatū Taonga</i> response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Use of terms                  | In first part of draft, terms 'arts' and 'culture' are used as if they refer to the same thing, but they are not the same | <p>"It seems to me that one of the biggest issues for an agency like MCH is actually addressing the issue of what is culture. While it is a broad term I am aware that there are various theoretical models that offer ways of understanding what the sector comprises and how those constituents connect together. My personal opinion, in 2022, is that 'art' as a category is not a priority category for government, that the priority category now, in terms of governance and resourcing, is 'culture'."</p> <p><b>The term 'culture' has been left deliberately broad for this LTIB, but we take this feedback on board and it can be something that is considered as we begin the next phases of LTIB work.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|                               | Lack of definition of 'culture' and 'cultural sector' throughout. This should be clear and evidence based                 | <p>"I believe that in terms of 'governing' culture one has to be clear about terms and category especially for something like culture which actually involves multiple governmental agencies. In order to govern and fund culture it seems to me that an agency like MCH should have some empirical data that in effect maps the territory."</p> <p>"... supportive of all activity that results in clear, consistent and cohesive definitions of "New Zealand culture" and "New Zealand content", ones that are sufficiently fluid as to engage with, and reflect, the continually evolving nature of being from, about or by Aotearoa New Zealand."</p> <p><b>This is noted, and will be discussed through the implementation phase.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|                               | The term 'cultural democracy' is unfamiliar- needs unpacking and definition in the context of cultural sector             | <p>Page 8 the first part of this sentence could say: 'Respondents suggested Manatū Taonga should focus on the ecosystem and growing collaborative, holistic approaches, rather than...'</p> <p><b>The term 'cultural democracy' was defined in the original footnote.</b></p> <p><b>Have added 'collaborative, holistic approaches' after first mention of ecosystem on page 8</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|                               | How 'ecosystem' is discussed should be connected to holistic collaboration                                                | <p>I think the ecosystem understanding also needs to connect to the discussion around collaborative holistic approaches (including the funding models), but also in terms of cross-sector and cross-ministry holistic non-siloed thinking. This also speaks to the way professional artists will also contribute to community spaces and beyond, and perhaps the Ministry - or some other body with a range of local, regional and national knowledge could help to articulate those connections in a more detailed way."</p> <p><b>This is noted, and will be discussed through the implementation phase.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|                               | References to 'bicultural' need to be consistent                                                                          | <p>"... the reference to 'bicultural identity' at page 18 of the LTIB could be amended to 'bicultural roots' for consistency with the remainder of the briefing (term used at page 29) and to acknowledge New Zealand has a multicultural identity with a bicultural heritage."</p> <p><b>We have ensured consistency in referring to 'bicultural identity' throughout. The term 'bicultural roots' in the section headed 'According to respondents...', was a term used by someone external through our workshops</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|                               | Meaning of the term 'tangata whenua' should be considered                                                                 | <p>"It is also important to recognise that 'tangata whenua' is not an ethnic quality, but a tikanga one, based on whakapapa, turangawaewae, and a continual spiritual connection with the local land/whenua. This is the case with my Wynyard/Winiata family who have been associated with Auckland/Devonport since 1845, similar to Ngati Whatua O Orakei who trace their linkage from 1837. It also reflects the bi-cultural ethnicity of virtually all Maori and a large number of pakeha. An important element for further expansive discussion as part of your Ministry's policy deliberations in the future."</p> <p><b>Feedback noted</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| Representation of sub-sectors | Lack of reference to libraries as part of ACH sector                                                                      | <p>"We would be grateful if you could consider how libraries fit into the broader arts, culture and heritage sector and perhaps make reference to us in your final draft. The draft LTIB currently doesn't mention libraries, and we do see ourselves as playing a role here. At its most basic, our role includes providing access to taonga and knowledge; supporting community cohesion, wellbeing and creativity; providing access to digital technology and information; and helping people build new knowledge. We consider that libraries very much share in your wider goals of ensuring we have a strong and vibrant culture and heritage sector across the motu. If it's helpful, there are some references to the value of libraries, and the role they might play in the future, <a href="#">in our LTIB</a>."</p> <p><b>Added section 'Gaps in the LTIB components...' on page 9 to refer to libraries, galleries, and regional museums and heritage organisations. We will also ensure collaboration with these organisations on the implementation phase of our LTIB work.</b></p> |

|                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|-------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                           | Lack of representation of regional heritage organisations and their issues                                                                                                                                                                                                              | <p>“My primary focus is on the traditional museum sector, particularly the smaller community museums and heritage groups that play a major part in preserving and presenting our history and heritage, particularly the social history. There is no distinct mention of this sector in the Briefing which has an academic focused aspirational overview rather than a practical focus on the needs and aspirations of this part of the sector. This is perhaps understandable in a five year briefing for Ministers, but is an absence that needs to be corrected. The workshop participants do not include any major provincial museums acknowledging Te Papa as the National Museum, and reflect national cultural organisations in the main. The key points for your immediate consideration is that the institutional museums, particularly those below the major provincial museums, are struggling to survive, many facing closure with the dual problem of financial pressures and being volunteer based, the ageing of their support groups and lack of new volunteers to take over senior roles. Auckland has an additional special problem of there being no "Museum of Auckland" presenting the post 1840 social, economic and cultural development of the city. This arises from a benign neglect by the Auckland War Memorial Museum and a shift in focus into a Sci-Tech direction of MOTAT away from the transport and technology focus it was founded for. Submissions are being made to the two museum's Draft Annual Plans to put this issue on their agendas, and will also be taken up with Auckland Council. With the new Government requirement of teaching New Zealand history in schools commencing next year, with a requirement to include local history as a core element it is absolutely critical that the smaller local heritage institutions and activities be nurtured and supported to take their crucial role in this new educational environment.”</p> <p><b>Feedback noted and will be passed onto relevant teams within Manatū Taonga – we will also broaden our engagement as we commence work on our next LTIB</b></p> |
|                                           | Particularly in relation to funding/investment- need to separate museums and galleries out as its own sector to provide more nuanced discussion, rather than refer to whole sector                                                                                                      | <p><b>Feedback noted and will be considered during the implementation phase of this work</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| Vision/strategy                           | Lack of overarching vision and cultural strategy/funding strategy for cultural sector- inclusion of this would provide shared understanding/common goals of future of sector and support ecosystem thinking and collaboration. This should be done collaboratively with agencies/sector | <p>Some submissions disagree with statement on page 23 that no strategy exists, noting their Action Plan and work they are doing across the sector.</p> <p>Feedback suggested a unified strategy could deliver greater wellbeing both within the sector, and to Aotearoa by connecting the sector better within itself, and with central and local government to influence policy especially in relation to the economic aspects of wellbeing.</p> <p><b>Text has been updated. This is also mentioned in the ‘roadblocks to overcome’ section.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Role of Ministry for Culture and Heritage | Lack of discussion of role of MCH                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | <p>“The <b>role of Manatū Taonga as system kaitiaki would also be helpful to highlight and define.</b> Current and future challenges require leadership from the centre and the Ministry can play a key role, leveraging its position to ensure that arts, culture and creativity are embedded in work across government.”</p> <p><b>The role of Manatū Taonga is noted in page 17.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| Freedom of expression                     | LTIB should consider role of freedom of expression- challenges and opportunities                                                                                                                                                                                                        | <p>Our primary area of feedback relates to the role of the right to freedom of expression in the LTIB. This right to freedom of expression is a fundamental right in our society, embodied in the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990. We consider various risks, and opportunities, are linked to the importance we place on the right in our liberal democracy. For example, the digital revolution has changed the way we consume media. It has also brought the issues of mis- and disinformation and hate speech, and the limitations of our current legislative framework, to the forefront. We consider freedom of expression is at the heart of the cultural sector. The public benefit of expression, to inform, entertain, and embody culture, is worth protecting and nurturing. The LTIB should reflect this importance.”</p> <p><b>Text has been updated under ‘the changing digital world...’ on page 12</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| COVID-19 funding/current issues           | Section on COVID-19 does not refer to how we will use insights to strengthen the sector in future                                                                                                                                                                                       | <p>“The sections that deal with COVID-19 funds could be strengthened by reference to capturing the learnings and impacts associated with these funding interventions, and how these new ways of supporting people and projects might help shape the strategy for supporting the New Zealand cultural sector from 2023 on.”</p> <p><b>Text has been added: Capturing the learnings and impacts associated with COVID-19 funding interventions, and using them to inform new ways of working might help shape the strategy for supporting the New Zealand cultural sector</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                                           | Lack of discussion of ongoing sector vulnerability and plans for the future                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <p>“The significant and increasing vulnerability of arts and culture sector in Aotearoa, with inadequate public investment, should also be highlighted in the briefing. While this was noted as a concern under the Funding, investment and value focus area, we need a clear plan to address the many financial challenges being faced by artists, practitioners and the sector, to ensure its survival and sustainability into the future.”</p> <p><b>Feedback noted and will be discussed in implementation phase – the LTIB does not include plans or recommendations</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |

|                       |                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Use of data/ evidence | Findings from new Creative Waikato report on arts and wellbeing may be of use                                    | <b><i>Text has been included on page 31: There was a call for more robust data and measurement, rather than ad hoc collection, with more weight given to ‘intangible’ values such as wellbeing. It was also noted that the approach should explore culturally appropriate ways of collecting data, beyond a Pākehā framework.</i></b><br><b><i>The 2022 research Wellbeing and the Arts, Culture and Creativity in the Waikato found an association between engagement with arts, culture and creativity and higher overall wellbeing and explores wellbeing in detail including connection to community, connection to culture, connection to place, connection to self, mental wellness, physical wellness, resilience and resources.</i></b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       | Evidence supports importance of NZ history, of which museums are a major part                                    | “I note also that in your Manatū Taonga data and general characteristics of the general cultural sector under the Social Value statistics “Arts, culture, and heritage contribute strongly to New Zealander's sense of nationhood” New Zealand history is 8% for all New Zealanders and with 8.9% for Māori; The key point is that New Zealand history is the highest of all the listed characteristics at 8% for all New Zealanders higher than Sports and Art and artistic achievement. That is higher than Sports and artistic achievement is a key indicator of the importance of the heritage sector of which physical museums are a major part.”<br><b><i>Feedback noted.</i></b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                       | Should include more data/evidence on career sustainability, wellbeing and arts and culture market                | “Providing key data and evidence as introductory context to the briefing and focus areas is helpful. Data on the <b>career sustainability and wellbeing of artists, arts practitioners and creative professionals</b> is important to include, as this <b>directly influences the vibrancy and resilience of the cultural sector ecosystem</b> . It's increasingly untenable for careers in the arts, culture and creativity sector to remain as unsustainable as they currently are. Broader data on the <b>impact of the arts, culture and creativity on New Zealanders’ wellbeing</b> and its <b>importance to New Zealand society and community cohesion</b> would also be helpful to see. It may also be helpful to highlight the healthy market for a diverse range of arts and culture in Aotearoa”<br><b><i>Text has been included in the ‘economic value’ section: Attaining career sustainability and reward is challenging for many creative professionals. The research A Profile of Creative Professionals 2019 found considerable variation in career sustainability by artform, and 55% of all creative professionals did paid work outside of the creative sector.</i></b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|                       | Evidence on value of museums may be helpful to include                                                           | <b><i>Feedback noted.</i></b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| <b>Te ao Māori</b>    |                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| <b>Topic</b>          | <b>Suggested revisions</b>                                                                                       | <b>Specific feedback and Manatū Taonga response</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Framing               | It is important to recognise that Māori values are not exclusive but shared by other cultures                    | “It is also important to recognise that many Te Ao Maori values are not exclusive but are shared by other cultures, core elements of humanity. Many blend naturally with the general culture of our community, and are recognised and supported by everyone.”<br><b><i>Feedback noted.</i></b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Collaboration         | A collective approach to building Māori sector capability would advance the aspirations outlined in the Briefing | “... supports building Māori leadership growing the capacity and capability of iwi/Māori in the arts, culture and heritage sector. Thought could be given to a sector approach to attract and develop Māori leaders and creatives and to support them throughout their careers. A collective approach could progress the aspirations outlined in the Briefing more quickly and on a bigger scale than each agency could achieve on its own and ensure agencies collectively grow the pool of Māori in the sector rather than competing with each other for those that are already there. Ensuring content made by these creatives is accessible to everyone and preserved for future generations will also support these creatives and provide benefits for all New Zealanders.”<br><b><i>New paragraph at bottom of section:</i></b><br><b><i>Feedback noted that a collective sector approach to attract and develop Māori leaders and creatives and support them throughout their careers could progress aspirations more quickly and on a larger scale than each agency could achieve on its own. Agencies could collectively grow the pool of Māori in the sector rather than competing with each other for those that are already there. Ensuring that content made by these creatives is accessible to everyone and preserved for future generations will also support these creatives and provide benefits for all New Zealanders</i></b> |
| Te Tiriti approach    | More nuance could be added to opportunities around Te Tiriti-based approach                                      | <b><i>Additional text included: Te Tiriti o Waitangi provides a unique place for all New Zealanders to stand and belong but needs to be underpinned by a recognition of the rights of Māori as tangata whenua, to have tūrangawaewae, a place to stand, and mana motuhake to make decisions as Māori, for Māori. It offers a foundation for new and inclusive conversations about our national identity</i></b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| Equity                | Discussion is needed on the fragility of the Māori arts ecology and infrastructure and issues of equity          | “It would be helpful for the briefing to also comment on the following areas so they can be addressed.<br><ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>The current fragility of the Māori arts ecology and infrastructure</b>, with very low numbers of senior active mātanga and pūkenga with the required mātauranga and technical proficiency across a number of artform areas (some now critically endangered). There’s</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |

|                                |                                                                                             | <p>also a need to increase the number of skilled and experienced Māori practitioners working in Producing, Project Management, Technical Production, Governance, Research and Policy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Equity in Crown investment</b> in ngā toi and mātauranga Māori, recognising that European artforms, institutions, heritage and sport continue to be valued and supported above arts, culture and creativity that are unique to Aotearoa New Zealand and its people. While investment has increased over recent years, there is still inequity in investment.</li> <li>• <b>Equitable access</b> to ngā toi Māori learning and development pathways, career development and leadership opportunities for Māori artists, arts practitioners and communities.” (8)</li> </ul> <p><b>New paragraph at end of section:</b><br/> <b>Feedback suggested existing inequities within the cultural sector ecosystem that negatively impact Māori must be surfaced to ensure future actions achieve equity. These include low numbers of practitioners with the necessary mātauranga and technical proficiency across a range of areas; investment that has historically favoured European arts, culture and heritage; and limited access to Māori learning and development pathways.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Mātauranga Māori Te Awe Kōtuku | Lack of mention of Mātauranga Māori Te Awe Kōtuku                                           | <p>“It would be good to see initiatives such as the <b>Mātauranga Māori Te Awe Kōtuku</b> programme, (where Crown investment has supported Māori-led programmes to protect and revitalise critically endangered and at-risk ngā toi Māori and mātauranga toi) highlighted as a model that could be extended to ensure artforms and mātauranga are retained for future generations of New Zealanders.”</p> <p><b>Feedback noted – considered out of scope for the LTIB</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Funding, Investment and Value  |                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Topic                          | Suggested revisions                                                                         | Specific feedback and <i>Manatū Taonga</i> response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| ‘Excellence’                   | Discussion of ‘excellence’ being missing from conversation may not be accurately understood | <p>“It is interesting to see the comment that "excellence" is missing from the conversation - because from some perspectives, the core of most arts funding for at least the last 10 years has been solely focussed on excellence at the detriment of community-engaged/functional art... and potentially this has also led to some of the less accessible arts activity that unfortunately doesn't contribute to growing cultural literacy, and ideally growing communities of new audiences who would be more proactively engaged with the higher-end arts activity. It is a tricky balance to hold definitely - and it is vital that there are contributions that go in all spaces, but we should also if making the comparison to high-performance sport and community sport, then look at the equivalent funding pools that exist in this country in the arts....</p> <p>Of course there are more nuanced calculations and other sources of funding.... but if I look at some single entity investments from some information I can see it might be:</p> <p>High performance arts - \$63M approx (CNZ Investment clients and arts grants)<br/> Community arts - \$5.5M approx (Creative Communities Scheme)<br/> High performance sport - \$62M approx (High Performance Sport NZ)<br/> Community sports - \$41M approx (Sport NZ)</p> <p>There is of course a lot more from other sources (\$76M from Pokies into Sports... \$11M into arts) so it is hard to exactly articulate that... but I do wonder if that response is part of the nature of the groups that might be aware and respond to this type of process.”</p> <p><b>Additional text included: ...excellence at the professional end of the arts spectrum is vital in leading and developing art forms, drawing international audiences and inspiring arts participation within communities, while investment in community art, like community sport, is more about participation and wider societal benefits.</b></p> <p><b>New sentence: Other feedback noted the need to find the balance between funding excellence or ‘high performance art’ and resourcing community-engaged art opportunities to support community outcomes and grow cultural literacy.</b></p> |
| Education pathways             | Pathways discussion could have additional nuance                                            | <p>“The pathways to jobs is an important one - particularly in that diversity/accessibility/young creative space. And that does also tie into having quality funded accessible activity in all communities that have sustainable funding to be able to create pathways for people that aren't fully reliant on volunteers - which can then help to build people into being professional practitioners - but the ability to join an arts company to work through an apprenticeship/mentoring /networks etc is more complex when the majority of the workforce is self-employed and the structure seems to thrive on that system - particularly for those in artforms that are important culturally and creatively, but may never have the same commercial structure as they aren't designed to work in that way. There is much in a holistic arts, culture and creative ecosystem that is designed to exist outside of a capitalist framework, and if we as a nation value that and the intangible benefits it brings, then we need to find a way to sustainably support it and champion the return that investment has in other measures.”</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |

|                         |                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Remuneration structures | Could discuss remuneration structures/issues in more depth                                      | <p><b>Feedback noted – this is something we would like to take into further consideration during the implementation phases</b></p> <p>“The need to reconsider <b>how artists and arts practitioners can be fairly remunerated</b> within the cultural ecosystem is a <b>critical issue</b> that will require new thinking about how government support for the sector operates. It would be beneficial to investigate how <b>basic income models</b> to maintain a skilled and specialised arts, cultural and creative workforce have worked internationally in <a href="#">Ireland</a>, <a href="#">New York</a> and <a href="#">France</a>, and how senior cultural knowledge holders are supported as Preservers of Important Intangible Cultural Properties in <a href="#">Japan</a>.”</p> <p>“We understand one of the concerns raised by respondents was the tendency to hire staff on a project basis rather than as long-term professionals. We also acknowledge MCH has data on the characteristics of the sector, noting it has a higher rate of self-employment (35.9%) when compared to the NZ workforce (16.7%).<sup>8</sup> We appreciate the issue is multi-faceted, and likely affects each part of the sector differently. We consider it useful to also acknowledge the rise of the ‘gig’ economy and the possible implications it has for the sector (although there is currently a lack of data on the issue). Further, it could be the type of employment is less relevant to the characteristics measured (such as wellbeing) if employment protections applied. To that extent, we consider it relevant to refer to the existing legislative framework and note an opportunity for the Government to promote behaviour and change, as well as responding to it.”</p> <p><b>Additional text included: Other suggestions included wage subsidies for employers, rebates to encourage reinvestment in the industry, and strategic conversations with other sectors such as tourism</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Valuation methods       | Discussion of wellbeing value/valuation methodologies could be more nuanced                     | <p>“The document talks about things being hard to quantify, but contributing to social cohesion, wellbeing, innovation and value... But it doesn’t articulate how wellbeing is a fundamental measure of things here - both through the Four Wellbeings of Local Government, as well as the Living Standards Framework. And while the four wellbeings are more societal, and the LSF is more subjective individual - both those considerations are important and have value. The other consideration is that while economic measures are a pathway to understand value, the real value of economic wellbeing (or having access to money) is that one can use that money to “buy joy” - essentially exchanging money and/or time for experiences, classes, activities, hobbies, arts and culture - so the value exists in a range of ways. I think perhaps the framing is that it is hard to express intangible value in equivalent cash figures - it is possible to express intangible value in narrative means - so perhaps we need to use the growth of cultural literacy as a pathway towards public good.”</p> <p>“We support the need to <b>improve how the public value that artists, arts practitioners and the arts, cultural and creativity sector provides is measured and promoted</b>, and that it would be beneficial for the work to be measured and reflected within the <b>Living Standards Framework, He Ara Waiora and the Social Cohesion Framework.</b>”</p> <p><b>Changes have been made to original text:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>The sector creates significant economic, social, cultural, educational, and emotional benefits. Some of these benefits are not easily conceptualised within simple metrics but this value is significant.</b></li> <li>• <b>Within an economic framing of this value, total value includes the direct benefits of participation and employment, but also the amenity value or vibrancy created in communities, and the inter-generational value of these assets. (Manatū Taonga Value of Culture Framework7)</b></li> <li>• <b>These multiple levels of value are highly contextual to the content and experiences shared between creatives and diverse participants and communities. So there is no simple formula to determine value. Frameworks and tools have been developed as guides and proxies. Different methods may need to be used to answer different questions, each reliant on sector experts, and local values to provide context and insight.</b></li> <li>• <b>Most New Zealanders aged 15+ (94 percent; General Social Survey 2016) participate in some form of cultural activity, be it going to the cinema or live music events, doing creative writing, visiting marae or visiting historic sites. This participation creates immense personal and social value.</b></li> </ul> |
|                         | There is an opportunity to develop a meaningful measurement framework for use across the sector | <p>“With Government increasingly looking for evidence and the use of wellbeing tools such as the Living Standards Framework and Ha Ara Waiora to measure the difference public spending makes, this provides an opportunity for the arts, culture and heritage sector to collectively develop a meaningful measurement framework to show the true impact of each agency as well as the impact of the sector as a whole. Public investment levels can then be aligned to the desired impacts over the short, medium and long term and ensure funding is delivered where and when it is needed.”</p> <p><b>Additional text included: There was a call for more robust data and measurement, rather than ad hoc collection, with more weight given to ‘intangible’ values such as wellbeing. It was also noted that the approach should explore culturally appropriate ways of collecting data, beyond a Pākehā framework. One suggestion was for the development of a sector-wide measurement framework to evidence agency and sector wide value. This would be aligned to the Living Standards Framework and Ha Ara Waiora.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |

|                          |                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Value and digital        | It is important to consider value in a digital space                                                                                              | <p>“There is also a different question around value in a digital space - what is something worth in a digital environment vs. a physical environment. Our perception of value is often that the online thing should be much cheaper - but for that to work it needs to have a big audience, which requires more marketing, which requires bigger budgets. Also, if something is digital, and the way pricing works is with supply and demand - when there is plenty of supply the cost has to be lower because there isn't an increased demand - so with digital content when there is infinite supply - the cost for demand is harder to articulate.</p> <p><b>Additional text included at the end of the section titled ‘How we value arts and culture needs to reflect the breadth of the sector’: It was also noted that calculating value and return on investment for new and existing digital cultural content and services requires specific examination of the costs and participant expectations for digital.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|                          | The connection between funding/investment and digital tech is missing                                                                             | <p>“I thought the former section [funding/investment/value] does well to outline the challenges, even if it feels unresolved in terms of next steps, though the latter [digital] section seems to be heavily focused on challenges and didn't seem to offer any suggestion that a connection between the two sections could offer solutions. The technology section also seems to be very focused on technological means of presenting work (ie. platforms for presenting work or making art with tech) but little in the way of how technology can facilitate administration, record-keeping and funding &amp; investment.”</p> <p><b>Additional text included: Digital technology has also changed employment and revenue patterns in the cultural and creative sectors. Digital also continues to provide new tools and efficiencies for creative professionals in business development, administration, marketing, funding and investment. This will also be considered during implementation phases.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| <b>Population Change</b> |                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| <b>Topic</b>             | <b>Suggested revisions</b>                                                                                                                        | <b>Specific feedback and Manatū Taonga response</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| Accessibility            | Section on population change focuses on diverse communities but does not address inclusion and accessibility for all underrepresented communities | <p>“What is missing from the briefing is reference to inclusion, that is, ensuring that there are practices in place, removal of barriers and a review of existing systems to ensure diverse and underrepresented communities are experiencing cultural safety in the cultural sector. This section makes reference to accessibility of the system for youth – we support this and note that accessibility needs to be considered for all underrepresented communities, particularly disabled communities.”</p> <p>“As the Briefing states population change is increasing the diversity of cultures that call Aotearoa/New Zealand home. This provides an opportunity to enrich the lives of all New Zealanders by sharing the stories of its diverse communities. Ensuring that there are pathways to enable diverse creatives to learn their craft and to earn a living from telling the stories of their communities is an important aspect of telling these stories authentically and giving diverse communities a voice. As outlined in the Te ao Māori section above, a sector approach could be effective in achieving this faster than each agency could achieve on its own.</p> <p>To ensure stories are shared within diverse communities and with all New Zealanders, it is important that they are accessible across the range of platforms that audiences engage with. It is also important that other groups that face challenges to accessing and engaging with arts, culture and heritage, such as the disabled community, are also supported.”</p> <p><b>See comments for ‘diversity’ below</b></p> |
| Diversity                | Section could acknowledge more the current diversity of NZ, issues among specific communities eg. Deaf and Disability, Asian, and social cohesion | <p><b>Additional text has been included:</b><br/> <b>Diversity is broader than ethnicity only. Many communities in Aotearoa New Zealand (e.g., Deaf and Disability, LGBTQIA+) have relatively low visibility and support across the cultural sector. The cultural sector is increasingly being identified as playing an important role in fostering social cohesion. This reflects a growing body of research that demonstrates the importance of arts, culture and creativity in relation to wellbeing, and its critical role in helping to establish a sense of identity and belonging.</b></p> <p><b>It is important to ensure that there are practices in place, removal of barriers and a review of existing systems to ensure diverse and underrepresented communities are experiencing cultural safety in the cultural sector. Ensuring that there are pathways to enable diverse creatives to learn their craft and to earn a living from telling the stories of their communities is an important aspect of giving diverse communities an authentic voice. These stories must be accessible on a range of platforms that audiences engage with.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Risks/ opportunities     | Could discuss additional risks/opportunities                                                                                                      | <p>We support the Ministry’s acknowledgment population change will affect our national cultural identity and create an appetite for more diverse creative and cultural participation. This is a great opportunity for the sector but, as noted above, can bring with it some risks. Effective regulation is needed to ensure expression reflects New Zealand values and contributes to the cultural sector, rather than devalues it.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

|                       |                                                                                                         | <p>We would also note a change in population presents an opportunity to extend manaakitanga and work to build up the cultural capability of smaller players in the sector. To that extent, we consider the Living Standards Framework wording regarding cultural capability could be a relevant touchstone.”</p> <p><b>Additional text included: Population change presents an opportunity to build up the cultural capability of smaller players in the sector so that people have 'the language, knowledge, connection and sense of belonging necessary to participate fully in one's culture or cultures, and helping others grow their cultural capability and feel a sense of belonging'. (footnote reference to The Treasury Living Standards Framework)</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Digital Technologies  |                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| Topic                 | Suggested revisions                                                                                     | Specific feedback and <i>Manatū Taonga</i> response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Social cohesion       | It is important to consider digitisation in the context of social cohesion                              | <p>“There is still learning to be done on how increased digital engagement is impacting mental health, social connection, community wellbeing, and more... and this shift has been rapidly increased due to the impacts of COVID. While there is value for some artforms to exist in a digital space, this is often only a support tool for the real business of the arts activity as shared experience - particularly those artforms that rely on interaction, engagement, participation and shared space - the digital space requires new forms of art, new forms of engagement - so it needs to be approached as a supplementary component, rather than replacement.”</p> <p><b>Additional text included: Digital technology has provided new ways to consume cultural goods and services and, in some areas, digital and new technologies have flipped consumption entirely. It is an open question about how this will evolve. Recent cultural participation research in New Zealand suggests that in areas that in cultural sector areas that bring people together into a collective experience such as live shows and galleries, preference for in-person experiences remains very strong. But for some groups including disabled peoples, digital options are very important.</b></p> |
| Opportunities         | Greater emphasis needed on opportunities rather than just challenges without solutions                  | <p>“I saw in the Analysis of Insights &amp; Submissions greater detail in the technology section about how development of crypto currency technology and NFTs could alter how transactions work, contracts and influence on the music industry and the way we value art. This seemed quite limited in scope and considering the <a href="#">MBIE long-term insights briefing</a> which focuses on the potential for blockchains and other distributed ledger technologies to shape how we work in the future, it seems like a greater emphasis could be placed on <b>opportunity</b> not just for greater commodification of digital art and music, but of considering how technology can support the funding of &amp; collecting data about the impact of all forms of art the we value in the arts, culture &amp; creativity sector.”</p> <p><b>Original bullet point has been modified to:</b><br/> <b>Development of crypto currency technology, blockchain and non-fungible tokens (NFTs) – altering how transactions work, creating contracts, providing new opportunities to measure value, influencing the music industry and other sectors, and influencing the way we value art.</b></p>                                                                                             |
| Education             | Education is needed to help people distinguish content                                                  | <p>“As the Briefing also states ensuring people have access to technology is necessary to enable local content to be accessible to all New Zealanders. Complementary to this is education to help people, particularly vulnerable people, distinguish content particularly at a time of mis/disinformation.”</p> <p><b>Additional text included: ...Global platforms were seen as both opportunity and threat, functioning as gatekeepers for content with the power to control customer data and capture the most valuable parts of the value chain. These developments emphasise the need for strong education to support information and digital literacies enabling navigation and discrimination of content.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Digital exclusion     | Could emphasise need to address digital exclusion and discuss role of MCH in relation to digital space  | <b>Feedback noted, and covered in existing content.</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| Regulatory frameworks | Could reference current work being done in regulatory space                                             | <p>“We support the acknowledgment our regulatory systems are no longer fit for purpose. As you will be aware, Te Tari Taiwhenua   the Department of Internal Affairs are undergoing a review of media and online content regulation. The reform could be referred to as a further opportunity to future-proof the sector.”</p> <p><b>Feedback noted</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Climate Change        |                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| Topic                 | Suggested revisions                                                                                     | Specific feedback and <i>Manatū Taonga</i> response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Opportunities         | Discussion could refer to potential of climate change arts projects as new form of storytelling         | “Climate change is an interesting element - perhaps even exploring climate change arts projects as a way of inspiring new messaging and storytelling - there is potential there.”                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|                       | There is an opportunity for MCH to play a role in connecting the sector to other work on climate change | “...supports actions that reduce the climate impact of the sector. Manatū Taonga could play a valuable role in achieving this by connecting the sector to the work underway across government that is designed to reduce New Zealand's greenhouse gas                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |

|                 |                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|-----------------|------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                 |                                                      | emissions. It could also facilitate Crown organisations in the sector sharing learnings and measurement frameworks as we collectively work towards achieving the Government's net zero target.”<br><b><i>Noted in the opportunities section.</i></b> |
| Adaptation plan | Could add additional risk re: adaptation plan timing | Our only suggestion is to note a potential risk is the adaptation plan being amended in the medium to long-term, requiring urgent changes to current practices.<br><b><i>Feedback noted.</i></b>                                                     |